Translating twelfth century China

With James M. Hargett’s lucid translation of the text and meticulous annotations of the Treatises of the Supervisor and Guardian of the Cinnamon Sea (Guihai yuheng zhi, hereafter Treatises) by Fan Chengda (1126–1193), a renowned official and scholar of the Song, this work has doubtlessly become more accessible to a much broader readership. Together with his translations of Fan’s other three works, Diary of a Boat Trip to Wu (Wuchuan lu), Diary of Mounting a Simurgh (Canluan lu), and Diary of a Boat Trip to Wu (Wuchuan lu), Professor Hargett, a leading scholar in the fledgling field of Chinese travel literature, has accomplished his aim to provide English readers with translations of all four major prose works of Fan.

Hang Lin

Reviewed publication:

CONSISTING OF 13 SECTIONS, each devoted to a particular category of objects, the book offers a wealth of geographical, historical, cultural, and ethnographical data about southwestern China – mainly Guangxi – in the twelfth century, ranging from landscape, minerals, flora and fauna to the history of various non-Han peoples and their cultures. In this review, rather than recounting the content of individual sections, I would like to touch upon some issues that emerge from the work itself. The original text by Fan, appended in full to the translation, is not voluminous at all. As a typical example of the youji (travel records) literature, the Treatises is written, as Hargett expounds, in a straightforward “reportorial-descriptive” language (p.xlvii). But a closer look at Fan’s methodological approach and the work’s content reveals that it is not a conventional youji but at once a gazetteer, an encyclopedia, and an ethnography. It contains both passages outlining the landmarks, vegetation, and people of particular localities, and repertorial accounts on those areas’ customs and products. For Hargett, the Treatises is not only “a personal memoir of Fan’s happy and restful days in Guilan in Guangxi”, but also “a serious and detailed scholarly study” (p.xxxix).

Like many of his contemporaries, Fan was not only a curious traveler but also a keen observer. Containing large amount of personal observations and detailed information from informants, many of them “not generally found in local gazetteers” (p.4), the Treatises reflects Fan’s strenuous effort to report information and to relate these facts to potential readers who probably knew little or nothing about these matters. In this sense, this work, like many other youji, is extremely valuable as a source work (p.xxxv).

The particular value of Fan’s accounts contained in the Treatises is enhanced by his relatively neutral attitude towards the area of Guangxi and the various non-Han peoples living there. For a long time in Chinese history, official history was sent to the remote and mountainous region of Guangxi for demotion or political exile. The reason why Fan headed for Guangxi was of no exception. However, Fan did not harbor much fear or distress but was surprisingly enthusiastic about his assignment. Guilan was certainly far from the Song political center in Lin’an (today’s Hangzhou), but when he arrived in Guilan in 1173 he “found peace of mind there” (p.3), and even after his tenure he still reminisced deeply attached to Guilan, so much that “he has” compiled and edited this “collection of minuta and trivia” (p.4). Furthermore, Fan did not find himself in “a strange, alien land” (p.xxx) populated by non-Han “barbarians” with whom he had not been assimilated into the orbit of Han-Chinese civilization, although Fan collectively termed them as men (literally: barbarians). In fact, he “refrained from ‘looking down on the local people’”, most of them probably non-Han, and “they in turn forgave my ignorance and trusted in my sincerity” (p.3).

As the issue of political legitimacy became thorny again under the political and military pressure of the non-Han “barbarians” from the north, in particular after the Jurchen seized the Song capital at Kaifeng and took over whole North China in 1127, there was a trend among Song literati to emphasize their cultural superiority over their non-Han neighbors to counteract their political and military inferiority and to strengthen legitimacy of their dynasty. Quite often too, those non-Han Chinese were described as “uncivilized barbarians”. But in the Treatises, Fan has clearly presented another pattern.

In fact, Fan’s observations and attitudes reflect how the Song endeavored to “maximize its control” in the southwestern border regions of the empire by “minimizing military conflict” with the large population of non-Han tribes-peoples (or peoples from the north) (p.xxix). As the Song was already facing enormous pressure from the north, it endeavored to adopt a rather friendly diplomacy toward the tribesmen in the southwest. The Song followed the practice of “minimizing military conflict” (youji) in the area of Guangxi with non-Han “barbarians” (jimi), to organize submissive tribal peoples (or peoples with the large population of non-Han tribes-peoples residing in the area of Guangxi) into the Chinese administrative hierarchy. Although many of the non-Chinese people on the Song’s southwestern borders were considered partially “sinicized”, but more often than not local chieftains still had near-autonomous control over land distribution and tax collection within their jurisdictions. But as long as this “loose rein” could bring peace for the Song, it was ready to accept the fact that the tribesmen’s subordination existed only in name.

As is unavoidable in any translation of medieval Chinese text, some may have other suggestions for the translation or interpretation of individual words or sentences. For instance, on page 163, Fan’s original sentence, which Hargett translates as “they receive corn allowances and office appointments but only at the rank of senior or junior envoy”, would much better fit the context if it were translated as “many settlement chiefs…[who purchased official ranks from the Song, but [they got] only military ranks ranging from 9b to 10]”. Nonetheless, such minor quibbles should by no means diminish the remarkable achievement James M. Hargett has made in his conscientious translation and painstaking study of Fan Chengda’s Treatises of the Supervisor and Guardian of the Cinnamon Sea. Containing rich data about the natural world, material culture, and ethnography in China’s southwestern frontier in the twelfth century, this book is bound to attract both experts and students of Chinese History, culture, and ethnography.

Hang Lin, University of Hamburg. (hang.lin@uni-hamburg.de)